

Federal Railroad Administration Office of Railroad Safety Accident and Analysis Branch

Accident Investigation Report HQ-2016-1149

Kansas City Southern Railway Company (KCS) Poteau, OK August 7, 2016

Note that 49 U.S.C. §20903 provides that no part of an accident or incident report, including this one, made by the Secretary of Transportation/Federal Railroad Administration under 49 U.S.C. §20902 may be used in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report.

SYNOPSIS

Synopsis

Kansas City Southern Railway (KCS) northbound train CTUKC-07, proceeding on signal indication in centralized train control territory on single main track, struck a 2011 grey Chevy Malibu (struck vehicle), with five occupants at a highway-rail grade crossing on August 7, 2016, at 1:19 p.m., CST, near Poteau, Oklahoma at Milepost 326.44 on KCS' Heavener Subdivision. The struck vehicle's driver and three passengers were fatally injured with a fourth passenger sustaining critical injuries. The crossing location was Dewey Street (U.S. DOT Crossing Number 330723X), in Poteau, OK, and was equipped with standard flashing lights, audible warning, and crossbucks. Damage resulting from this accident included \$150 to the lead locomotive, \$636 to track and signal damage, and \$8000 to the struck vehicle. There was no derailment or hazardous materials released, and no injuries to the train crew. At the time of the accident, the weather was clear, 95 °F with calm winds and 59% humidity. FRA concluded the probable cause of the accident was the driver of the automobile failed to stop at the highway-rail grade crossing, cause code M303 – highway user misjudgment under normal weather and traffic conditions.

U.S. Department of Transportation Federal Railroad Administration	FRA FA	ACTU	JAL R	AILROA	\D	ACCIDE	NT RE	POR	T FR	A File #HQ-2016-1149	
TRAIN SUMMARY											
1. Name of Railroad Operating Train #1						1a. Alphabetic Code		lb. Railı	road Acc	ccident/Incident No.	
Kansas City Southern Railway Company					KCS	5	16080702				
GENERAL INFORMATION											
1. Name of Railroad or Othe		la. Alphabetic	Code	1b. Railroad Accident/Incident No.							
Kansas City Southern Ra		KCS 1608070			0702	702					
2. U.S. DOT Grade Crossing	ĺ.	3. Date of Accident/Incident 4.			. Time of Accident/Incident						
330732X		8/7/2016	1:19 PM								
5. Type of Accident/Incident Hwy-Rail Crossing											
6. Cars Carrying HAZMAT7. HAZMAT Cars Damaged/Derailed8. Cars Releasing HAZMAT					0	9. People Evacuated	0 10. Subo Heave). Subdiv Heavener	livision Ier	
11. Nearest City/Town	12. Milepost (to nearest tenth) 13.				State Abbr.	y .					
Poteau	326.44			0	OK LE FI		FLORE				
15. Temperature (F)	17. Weather				18. Type of Track						
95 °F	Day	Clear					Main				
19. Track Name/Number	20. FRA Track Class					21. Annual Track Densi		Density	22. Time Table Direction		
Main	Freight	t Trains-6	0, Passenger	Tra	ains-80 (gross tons in mill 40.73		illions)	North			

U.S. Department of Transpo Federal Railroad Administra	rtation tion	FRA FACTUAL RAILROAD ACCIDENT REPORT FRA File #HQ-2016-1149												2016-1149		
OPERATING TRAIN #1																
1. Type of Equipment Consist: Freight Train								2	ipment A	ttended?	2d? 3. Train Number/Symbol					
4 Speed (recorded spe	ed	Code 5	Trail	ling Tons (gra	. Contro	lled Locor	notive?				KC-07	Code				
if available)	eu,	ecode	g power units)	0 = Not a rem	notely co	ntrolled o		Code							
R - Recorded 52	MPH	E	2945			1 = Remote control portable transmitter 2 = Remote control tower operation										
E - Estimated						ontrol p	ortable tra	nsmitter - 1	more that	i one remo	te control	transm	litter			
Signalization																
Signaled																
Signaled Method of Operation/Authority for Movement:																
Signal Indication																
Supplemental/Adjunct Codes:																
7 Dringing Car/Unit a Initial and Number h Desition in Turing a Londod (199/10) 9 If wilload grantarias(a) tootod for Alash-1 During														Drugs		
	a. 11111		noer		ITalli	C. LUaded (yes/110)	drug/alcohol use, enter the				Drugs				
(1) First Involved (derailed, struck, etc.)		1 1					numbe	number that were positive			0		0			
(2) Causing (if		1		1		110		appropriate box				Scengers?		0		
mechanical,		N/A		0		no		<i>y</i> . Wus u		unsport	ing pussen	engers.				
cause reported)		1	0										No			
10. Locomotive Units	a. Head	Mid	Train	F	lear E	nd 11. Cars	de FMI	r	Loaded			Empty				
DMU, and Cab	End b.			c. d.	e. DMU, and Cal		Cab a. b.		с.	d.		e.				
Car Locomotives.)		Manual	Rei	mote Manual	Re	tote Car Locomotives.)			Freight Pass.		Freight	t Pass. Cab		Caboose		
(1) Total in Train	2	0					(1) Total in Equipmen			0	120	0		0		
	Z	0		0 0		I Consi	st		0	0	120	0		0		
(2) Total Derailed	0	0	0	0) (2) To	otal Dera	iled	0	0	0	0		0		
12 Equipment Damage	- This C	neist	13 T	Track Signal	Way	& Structure D	amage									
12. Equipment Damage 150	- 1 III 5 C	5113131	15. 1	63	86 86	e Sudetuie Da	amage									
14. Primary Cause Coc	le	I														
M303 - Highway us	er misj	udgment	under	normal wea	ther	and traffic co	ondition	S								
15. Contributing Caus	e Code															
	Nu	mber of C	rew N	lembers						Length o	of Time on	Duty				
16. Engineers/Operator	. Conductors		19. Brakemer	n 20. 1	20. Engineer/Operator			21. Cond	uctor							
1	1 0			1		0	Hrs	0	Mins: 55		Hrs: 0		Mins: 55			
Casualties to:	22 Ra	ilroad	23	23. Train Passengers		24 Others	25	25. EOT Device?		55	26 Was	EOT Devi	ce Pron	erly Armed?		
Employees			200 114111 1 400 engens		21. 0 11015	2011				20. 1145		cc 110p				
Fatal		0		0		4		No						N/A		
Nonfatal		0	0			1	27. •	27. Caboose Occupied by Crew?						N/A		
28. Latitude		5	29	. Longitude		1								1 1/ / 1		
35.048271000 -94.617462000																

FRA FACTUAL RAILROAD ACCIDENT REPORT FRA File #HQ-2016-1149

CROSSING INFORMATION

Highway User Involved						Rail Equipment Involved							
1. Туре				:	5. Equipment								
Auto						Train (Units Pulling)							
2. Vehicle Speed (est. mph at impa	ct) 3. Direc	ction (g	eograph	ical)	(6. Position of Car Unit in Train							
45	Eas	t				1							
4. Position of Involved Highway U	ser				,	7. Circumstance							
Moved over Crossing						Rail Equipment Struck Highway User							
8a. Was the highway user and/or ra in the impact transporting ha	t involv erials?	ved		:	8b. Was there a hazardous materials release by								
Neither						Neither							
8c. State here the name and quantit N/A	y of the haza	rdous 1	material	released, if	f any.								
9. Type of Crossing				10. Si	gnaled	Crossing Warning		11. Roadway Conditions					
1. Gates4. Wig wags2. Cantilever FLS5. Hwy. traffic signals3. Standard FLS6. Audible	 7. Crossbucks 8. Stop signs 9. Watchman 	10. Flagg 11. Other 12. None	ged by crew	, 1,	1			Dry					
3, 6, 7													
12. Location of Warning 13. Crossing Warning I Both Sides No						terconnected with	sing Illuminated by Street Lig Lights	ghts or					
15. Highway User's Age 16. Highw	ender	17. Higl and	hway User Struck or	Went l was Str	Behind or in Front of Train ruck by Second Train	18. Highv	way User						
37 Fema	Female No						Die	d not stop					
19. Driver Passed Standing Highwa	ay Vehicle	20. \	view of '	Track Obsc	cured b	y (primary obstruction)							
No			Not O	bstructed									
Casualties to:	Casualties to: Killed Inju			21. Driver Killed	was		22. Was Driver in the Vehicle? Yes						
3. Highway-Rail Crossing Users 4 1]	24. Highwa Damage (<i>e</i> .	ay Veh est. doll	icle Property 8000 (ar damage)	25. Total Number of Vehicle 5 Occupants (including driver)						
26. Locomotive Auxiliary Lights?	1				/ 1	27. Locomotive Auxiliary	Lights Op	erational?					
Yes						Yes							
28. Locomotive Headlight Illumina	ated?				, i	29. Locomotive Audible Warning Sounded?							
Yes					Yes								

10. Signaled Crossing Warning

1 - Provided minimum 20-second warning

2 - Alleged warning time greater than 60 seconds

3 - Alleged warning time less than 20 seconds

4 - Alleged no warning

5 - Confirmed warning time greater than 60 seconds

6 - Confirmed warning time less than 20 seconds

7 - Confirmed no warning

N/A - N/A

Explanation Code

A - Insulated rail vehicle

B - Storm/lightning damage

C - Vandalism

D - No power/batteries dead

E - Devices down for repair

F - Devices out of service

G - Warning time greater than 60 seconds attributed to accident-involved train stopping short of the crossing, but within track circuit limits, while warning devices remain continuously active with no other in-motion train present

H - Warning time greater than 60 seconds attributed to track circuit failure (e.g., insulated rail joint or rail bonding failure, track or ballast fouled)

J - Warning time greater than 60 seconds attributed to other train/equipment within track circuit limits K - Warning time less than 20 seconds attributed to signals timing out before train's arrival at the

crossing/island circuit L - Warning time less than 20 seconds attributed to train operating counter to track circuit design

direction

M - Warning time less than 20 seconds attributed to train speed in excess of track circuit's design speed

N - Warning time less than 20 seconds attributed to signal system's failure to detect train approach

O - Warning time less than 20 seconds attributed to violation of special train operating instructions

P - No warning attributed to signal systems failure to detect the train

R - Other cause(s). Explain in Narrative Description

SKETCHES



NARRATIVE

Circumstances Prior to the Accident

The crew of Kansas City Southern Railway (KCS) northbound train CTUKC-07 (striking train) included a locomotive engineer and conductor who were on duty at 12:30 p.m., CST, on August 7, 2016, at Poteau, Oklahoma, with a destination of Kansas City, Missouri. Both crew members received more than the statutory off-duty period prior to reporting for duty.

The striking train consisted of three locomotives and 120 empty railcars with one of the locomotives positioned on the rear of the train in Distributive Power configuration, and was 2,945 tons and 6,195 feet in length.

The accident occurred at milepost (MP) 326.44 on the KCS Heavener Subdivision, which is single main track and in centralized traffic control territory as indicated by the KCS railroad timetable in effect at the time of the accident. Maximum authorized speed for freight trains is 55 mph. The railroad timetable direction of the train was north, geographic direction northeast. Timetable directions are used throughout this report.

The Dewey avenue crossing, DOT crossing 330723X, (the crossing) is a public highway crossing at grade over a single main line. Estimated train traffic is 24 trains per day, and the crossing is equipped with advanced warning signs, stop lines, railroad crossing symbols, incandescent flashing lights and bells. Dewey avenue is a two lane, paved street that intersects with the railroad main line at an approximate 90-degree angle. The speed limit of Dewey avenue is posted at 25 mph.

Just prior to the accident, a 2011 grey Chevy Malibu (struck vehicle), with five occupants was traveling eastbound on Dewey avenue approaching the crossing. The view to the south, while traveling in the direction of the struck vehicle, is partially obstructed by a residential building adjacent to the railroad right-of-way.

At the time of the accident, the weather was clear, 95 °F with calm winds and 59% humidity. **The Accident**

The Striking Train

The striking train was being operated northbound at 52 mph approaching the crossing and the Engineer was blowing the horn, as recorded by the lead locomotive's event recorder. The view of the struck vehicle was obstructed by a commercial building and a residence on the west side of the tracks as it approached the crossing. When aware of the pending collision, the Conductor initiated an emergency brake application at 1:19:05 p.m., as the striking train impacted the passenger side of the struck vehicle at about the mid-point. The lead locomotive came to a final stop 1,683 feet after the point of impact (POI). After conferring with emergency responders, the Conductor separated the train to cut the crossing allowing better access to the struck vehicle. The Conductor was then transported back to the lead

locomotive by a KCS Operations Supervisor and the Engineer and Conductor provided a statement to a Poteau Police Officer.

The Struck Vehicle

The struck vehicle entered the crossing in front of the striking train. Per witness statements taken by a Poteau Police Officer, the struck vehicle appeared to speed up to try and "beat the train". Because of the impact, the struck vehicle was pushed north and east coming to rest 133 feet from the POI. Two passengers were ejected from the vehicle, and a nearby witness called 911.

Police, fire, and medical emergency personnel responded and extracted the driver and the two remaining passengers from the car. The driver and three of the passengers were fatally injured and one passenger was critically injured. The critically injured passenger was taken from the scene by Tulsa Life Flight to Saint John's Hospital. The other three passengers and driver were transported from the scene by Evens and Miller Funeral Home.Neither crew member reported suffering any injuries, and no hazardous material was released by the train and the engine received minor damage. Damage resulting from this accident included \$150 to the lead locomotive, \$636 to track and signal damage, and \$8000 to the struck vehicle. KCS operations, track, and signal personnel were dispatched to the scene to investigate.

Post-Accident Investigation

The Federal Railroad Administration (FRA) began an investigation of this accident/incident. Upon commencing its investigation, FRA investigators inspected the accident site, active warning devices at the crossing, toxicology analysis, and reviewed documents provided by outside agencies. After their on-site inspection and investigation FRA conducted interviews with the train crew of the striking train. FRA's investigators also requested and received all records, forms, and other documentation necessary to conduct their final analysis and draw conclusions concerning the pertinent facts of the accident/incident. The following analysis and conclusions, as well as any possible contributing factors and the probable cause in this report, represents the findings of FRA's investigation. **Analysis and Conclusions**

<u>Analysis - Highway-Rail Grade Crossing Warning Devices:</u> The highway-rail crossing at grade was equipped with warning lights and bells without gates. On the westbound approach to the crossing (opposite from the struck vehicle's approach), there were faded pavement markings and an advanced warning sign. On the eastbound approach to the crossing (the struck vehicle's approach), there were faded pavement markings placed just ahead of an intersection at which the advanced warning sign appeared to have been placed previously, however, no advanced warning sign was present on that side at the time of the accident.

While the view of the approaching train was obstructed by a residence and a commercial structure between the advanced warning pavement markings and the crossing, the view of the train was unobstructed across railroad property and across a vacant lot adjacent to railroad property. The view of the active crossing warning devices was not obstructed at any point between the advanced warning markings and the crossing.

A whistle board was posted on the railroad right-of-way approximately 1,000 feet south of the crossing.

Event recorder data indicates that the whistle was being blown by the striking train in approach to the crossing. The active warning devices were tested by a KCS signal maintainer after the accident, and found to function as intended. The crossing was later tested by the signal maintainer in the presence of an FRA signal inspector with no exceptions noted to the operation of the crossing. Inspection of the crossing revealed that it was in relatively good condition, except for the pavement markings and missing advanced warning sign west of the crossing. The active warning devices functioned as intended and the train horn was sounding on the approach of the crossing.

<u>Conclusion</u>: FRA determined the warning devices did not contribute to the cause of severity of this accident.

<u>Analysis – Toxicological</u>: The Tulsa Oklahoma coroner performed toxicological testing on the remains of the driver, and the results were negative. There were no toxicological tests performed on the train crew. FRA does not require such testing for this type of accident.

<u>Conclusion</u>: FRA determined toxicology did not contribute to the cause or severity of the accident. <u>Analysis – Outside Agency Findings</u>: According to the Poteau police report, the vehicle "failed to stop for a railroad signal". Two witnesses interviewed by police, stated that the vehicle sped up to beat the train over the crossing. Both witnesses indicated that the crossing lights were flashing and that they heard the train's horn as it approached the crossing.

<u>Conclusion</u>: FRA determined the actions of the struck vehicle was the probable cause of this accident. **Overall Conclusions**

The railroad was in full compliance with its own rules and all applicable federal regulations. The city was missing an advanced warning sign on the approach to the crossing on the west side and the advanced warning pavement markings were faded, however the faded pavement markings and missing advanced warning sign did not prevent the driver from detecting the presence of the train in time to act. The two witnesses' statements included in the police report state that the driver was speeding and that the driver accelerated to beat the train.

Probable Cause and Contributing Factors

FRA concluded the probable cause of the accident was the driver of the automobile failed to stop at the highway-rail grade crossing, cause code M303 – highway user misjudgment under normal weather and traffic conditions.

FRA did not identify any contributing factors that contributed to the cause or severity of this accident.