## U.S. DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION FEDERAL RAILROAD ADMINISTRATION Washington, D.C. 20590

### Locomotive Engineer Review Board

Decision Concerning CSX Corporation's Revocation of Mr. P. L. Fisher's Locomotive Engineer Certification

### FRA Docket Number EQAL-2010-39

#### Decision

The Locomotive Engineer Review Board (Board) of the Federal Railroad Administration (FRA) has reviewed the decision of the CSX Corporation (CSX) to revoke Mr. P. L. Fisher's (Petitioner) locomotive engineer certification (certification) in accordance with the provisions of Title 49, Part 240 of the Code of Federal Regulations (49 C.F.R. Part 240). The Board hereby determines that CSX's decision to revoke Petitioner's certification was proper for the reasons set forth below.

### **Background**

On July 12, 2010, while operating Train N67207, Petitioner allegedly operated into an overlapping track warrant, without permission at Buckingham Branch Railroad, (BBRR) milepost (MP) 134. CSX asserts that Petitioner violated Federal Regulation 49 C.F.R. § 240.117(e)(4), prohibiting Petitioner from occupying track without proper authority when he failed to comply with Operating Rules 6.3 and 14.5, which required Petitioner to receive permission from the other employee listed on the track warrant prior to entering overlapping track warrant limits.

The train crew consisted of the Petitioner and a conductor. The crew was called to operate train N67207 from MP CA 83, Richmond, VA. to MP CA 278 Clifton Forge, VA. Between MPs CA 85.5 - 117.9 and CA 111.9 - 159.3, the crew had authority for movement under track warrant control issued by the BBRR Rail Traffic Controller (RTC). Between MP 134 and MP 136 track warrant limits were occupied by another employee, Mr. Martin. The crew entered the overlapping track warrant limits at MP 134 without contacting Mr. Martin.

By letter dated August 23, 2010, Petitioner was notified that his certificate was revoked for occupying track without proper authority. A petition was timely filed with FRA on September 28, 2010, by the Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers and Trainmen on behalf of Petitioner, requesting that FRA review CSX's decision to revoke Petitioner's certification. Petitioner asserts that the revocation was improper because:

- (1) CSX misapplied 49 C.F.R. § 240.117(e)(4) as it pertains to occupying main track or segment of track without authority. The fact that Petitioner had a track warrant from the BBRR RTC gave him authority to enter the track and also told him how to operate, at restricted speed. Therefore, CSX has not met its burden of proof.
- (2) Track warrant control issued by the RTC was an intervening cause.
- (3) There was never a direct or potential adverse effect on rail safety and CSX should have used its discretion as provided in 49 C.F.R. § 240.307(i)(2) to allow Petitioner to keep his certification.

Pursuant to 49 C.F.R. § 240.405(b) and (c), a copy of the petition was sent to CSX, and the railroad was afforded an opportunity to comment. CSX's response was received by FRA on, January 18, 2011.

# CSX' Response

CSX responded to Petitioner's assertions by arguing that:

- Petitioner operated his train past MP 134 without proper authority. In fact, Petitioner and his conductor testified that they entered the limits of employee, Mr. Martin, at MP 134 without contacting him for permission. See Tr. at 29, 30, 37, 39.
- (2) The intervening cause exception applies only when it would prevent or materially impair the locomotive engineer's ability to comply with the Federal regulations. In this case, the track warrant did not prevent Petitioner from adhering to the BBRR operating rules and complying with the Federal regulations. It was Petitioner's apparent misunderstanding of those rules that resulted in noncompliance with the Federal regulations.
- (3) Section 240.307(i)(2) does not require CSX to exercise its discretion by permitting Petitioner to keep his certification when Petitioner violates the Federal regulations. Moreover, clearly this type of violation is one which could have resulted in an injury since Petitioner was operating his train where workers were present.

## Analysis of the Petition

Petitioner's first assertion raises a factual issue. Accordingly, "[w]hen considering factual issues, the Board will determine whether there is substantial evidence to support the railroad's decision, and a negative finding is grounds for dismissal." 58 Fed. Reg. 18982, 19001 (April 9, 1993). Petitioner asserts that the track warrant from the BBRR RTC gave him authority to enter the track at MP 134 at restricted speed. Operating Rules 6.3 and 14.5, require Petitioner to receive

permission from the other employee listed on the track warrant prior to entering overlapping track warrant limits. See Petitioner's Exhibit C-9. Petitioner's track warrant control from the BBRR RTC states that track limits between MP 134 and MP 136 are occupied by Mr. Martin. See Petitioner's Exhibit C-11. Petitioner and his conductor testified that they entered the limits of employee, Mr. Martin, at MP 134 without contacting him for permission. See Tr. at 29, 30, 37, 39. As such, the Board finds that substantial evidence shows that Petitioner operated his train past MP 134 without proper authority.

Petitioner's second assertion is that the track warrant issued by the BBRR RTC was an intervening cause that prevented him from complying with the Federal regulations. Section 240.307(i)(1) provides that "[a] railroad shall not determine that the person failed to meet the qualification requirements of this part and shall not revoke the person's certification . . . if sufficient evidence exists to establish that an intervening cause prevented or materially impaired the locomotive engineer's ability to comply with the railroad operating rule or practice which constitutes a violation under § 240.117(e)(1) through (e)(5) of this part." Intervening causes must be analyzed on a case-by-case basis. 64 Fed. Reg. 60982. In this case, the track warrant did not prevent the Petitioner from adhering to the BBRR operating rules and complying with the Federal regulations. It was Petitioner's apparent misunderstanding of those rules that resulted in noncompliance with the Federal regulations. After obtaining the track warrant to operate past MP 134, the operating rules required Petitioner to contact Mr. Martin for permission to enter the limits. Petitioner did not contact Mr. Martin. See Tr. at 29, 30, 37, 39.

Petitioner's third assertion is that CSX should have used its discretion as provided in 49 C.F.R. § 240.307(i)(2) to allow Petitioner to keep his certification, because Petitioner's actions never had a direct or potential adverse effect on rail safety. Section 240.307(i)(2) does not require CSX to exercise its discretion. The regulation merely provides railroads with the option to use discretion in certain cases. Moreover, the Board believes that this type of violation is one which could have resulted in an injury, as Petitioner was operating his train where workers were present.

### **Conclusion**

Based on the above findings and conclusions, the Board hereby denies the petition in accordance with the provisions of Title 49, Part 240 of the Code of Federal Regulations.

Issued in Chicago, IL on MAY 0 9 2011

Richard M. McCord Chairman, Locomotive Engineer Review Board

#### SERVICE LIST EQAL 2010-39

A copy of the Locomotive Engineer Review Board decision in this matter has been sent by certified mail to each person shown below.

CERTIFIED MAIL RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

P. L. Fisher P.O. Box 35 Iron Gate, VA 24448-0035

R. H. Tolley
Local Chairman Committee of Adjustment Division 38
BLE&T
745 High Street
Clifton Forge, VA 24422

Sarah E. Hall Associate General Counsel Corporate and Transportation Law CSX Corporation 500 Water Street, J150 Jacksonville, FL 32202

Diane Filipowicz

Administrative Assistant

MAY 0 9 2011

Date

enc: Post LERB Memo

cc: FRA Docket EQAL 2010-39

	SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION	COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DELIVERY	
	Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete	A. Signature	
	Item 4 If Restricted Delivery is desired.	X	Agent
	Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you.		C. Date of Delivery
	<ul> <li>Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits.</li> </ul>		
	1. Article Addressed to:	D. Is delivery address different from item If YES, enter delivery address below	
	Sarah E. Hall, Associate General	Counsel	
	Corporate and Transportation Law		
	CSX Corporation		
	500 Water Street, J150	3. Service Type	
	Jacksonville, FL 32202	23-Certified Mali C Express Mali	·
			ipt for Merchandise
	EQUAL 2010-39	4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee)	Ves
	2. Article Number 7008 323	0 0002 3925 4787	
	(iransier from service label)		102595-02-M-1540
	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Re	etum Receipt	102000-02-00-000
	SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION	COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DELI	VERY
	Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete	A. Signature	
	Item 4 If Restricted Delivery is desired.	x	Agent
	Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you.		Addressee
	<ul> <li>Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits.</li> </ul>	B. Received by (Printed Name)	C. Date of Delivery
	1. Article Addressed to:	D. Is delivery address different from item if YES, enter delivery address below	
	R H Tollow Local Chairman		
	R. H. Tolley, Local Chairman		
	Committee of Adjustment Divisio	n 38	
		3. Service Type	
	745 High Street	25.Certified Mail Depress Mail	1
	Clifton Forge, VA 24422		lpt for Merchandise
	0010 00	Insured Mell C.O.D.	
	EQUAL 2010-39	4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee)	Ves
	2. Article Number	0 0002 3925 4770	
Proto		stum Receipt	102595-02-M-1540
jangenen Kanana anakara anak			102595-02 <del>-M</del> -1540
<b>Pagasa</b> Linasa ang ang ang ang ang ang ang ang ang an			· · · · · ·
	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Re SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION	etum Recelpt	· · · · · ·
<b>277.56</b>	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Research Domestic Research Domestic Research Domestic Research Domestic Research Delivery is desired.	etum Recelpt COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL A. Signature	IVERY
	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Re SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION  Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse	etum Recelpt COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL A. Signature X	IVERY
<b>Pagaa</b>	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Re SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you. Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece,	etum Recelpt COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL A. Signature	IVERY
<b>277.56</b>	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Re SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you.	etum Recelpt          COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL         A. Signature         X         B. Received by (Printed Name)	IVERY
	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Re SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you. Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece,	etum Recelpt COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL A. Signature X	Agent Addresse C. Date of Deliver
	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Re SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you. Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits.	etum Recelpt          COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL         A. Signature         X         B. Received by (Printed Name)         D. Is delivery address different from ite	Agent Addresse C. Date of Deliver
<b>Freedor</b>	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Reference in the second sec	etum Recelpt          COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL         A. Signature         X         B. Received by (Printed Name)         D. Is delivery address different from ite	Agent Addresse C. Date of Deliver
<b>Project</b>	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Restricted Delivery is desired. Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you. Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits. 1. Article Addressed to: P. L. Fisher	etum Recelpt          COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL         A. Signature         X         B. Received by (Printed Name)         D. Is delivery address different from ite	Agent Addresse C. Date of Deliver
	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Restricted Delivery is desired.  SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION  Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired.  Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you.  Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits.  Article Addressed to:  P. L. Fisher P.O. Box 35	eturn Recelpt  COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL  A. Signature  X  B. Received by (Printed Name)  D. Is delivery address different from ite If YES, enter delivery address belo	Agent Addresse C. Date of Deliver
	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Restricted Delivery is desired. Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you. Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits. 1. Article Addressed to: P. L. Fisher	eturn Recelpt  COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL  A. Signature X  B. Received by (Printed Name)  D. Is delivery address different from ite If YES, enter delivery address belo  3. Service Type	Agent Addresse C. Date of Deliver m 1? Yes w: No
	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Restricted Delivery is desired.  SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION  Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired.  Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you.  Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits.  Article Addressed to:  P. L. Fisher P.O. Box 35	sturn Receipt         COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL         A. Signature         X         B. Received by (Printed Name)         D. Is delivery address different from iter         If YES, enter delivery address belo         3. Service Type         X         E. Received by (Printed Name)         D. Is delivery address belo         If YES, enter delivery address belo         E. Service Type         X	Agent Addresse C. Date of Deliver m 1? Yes w: No
	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Restricted Delivery is desired.  SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION  Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired.  Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you.  Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits.  Article Addressed to:  P. L. Fisher P.O. Box 35	Sturn Receipt         COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL         A. Signature         X         B. Received by (Printed Name)         D. Is delivery address different from ite if YES, enter delivery address belo         3. Service Type         X Certified Mail	Agent Addresse C. Date of Deliver m 1? Yes w: No
	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Research SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you. Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits. Article Addressed to: P. L. Fisher P.O. Box 35 Iron Gate, VA 24448-0035	Sturn Receipt   COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL   A. Signature   X   B. Received by (Printed Name)   D. Is delivery address different from iter   If YES, enter delivery address belo     3. Service Type   X   B. Registered	Agent Addresse C. Date of Deliver m 1? Yes w: No
	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Research SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION © Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. © Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you. © Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits. 1. Article Addressed to: P. L. Fisher P.O. Box 35 Iron Gate, VA 24448-0035 EQN. 2010-39	Sturn Receipt         COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL         A. Signature         X         B. Received by (Printed Name)         D. Is delivery address different from ite If YES, enter delivery address belo         3. Service Type         X         B. Registered         X         B. Registered         X         B. Registered	Agent Addresse C. Date of Deliver m 1? 2 Yes w: 2 No

,