# U.S. DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION FEDERAL RAILROAD ADMINISTRATION Washington, D.C. 20590

#### Locomotive Engineer Review Board

Decision Concerning Burlington Northern Santa Fe Railway Company's Revocation of Mr. K. J. Cross Locomotive Engineer Certification

## FRA Docket Number EQAL 2011-36

### **Decision**

The Locomotive Engineer Review Board (Board) of the Federal Railroad Administration (FRA) has reviewed the decision of the Burlington Northern Santa Fe Railway Company (BNSF) to revoke Mr. K. J. Cross's (Petitioner) locomotive engineer certification (certification) in accordance with the provisions of Title 49, Part 240 of the Code of Federal Regulations (49 C.F.R. Part 240). The Board hereby denies Mr. Cross's petition for the reasons set forth below.

## Background

On May 8, 2011, at approximately 11:00 p.m., Petitioner allegedly operated BNSF train HOUALTI-08 in Galveston, TX past a signal requiring a complete stop at mile post (MP) 135.8. By undated letter signed by Petitioner on May 9, 2011, Petitioner was notified that his certification was suspended pending a hearing investigating the incident. That letter stated that Petitioner was entitled to a formal hearing in compliance with 49 C.F.R. § 240.307 and that Petitioner could waive his right to the hearing. In a separate letter, dated May 8, 2011, Petitioner signed a waiver of his right to a formal hearing under 49 C.F.R. § 240.307. This letter indicated the revocation period for violations of railroad operating rules implementing 49 C.F.R. § 240.117(e)(1), prohibiting operation of a train not in accordance with a signal requiring a complete stop before passing it, would begin on May 8, 2011 and conclude on June 7, 2011.

A petition was timely filed with FRA by mail on October 31, 2011 by the Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers and Trainmen on behalf of Petitioner, requesting that FRA review BNSF's decision to revoke his certification. The petition asserts that the revocation was improper because:

- (1) Petitioner's view of the signal was obstructed, substantially impairing his ability to comply with the operating rule,
- (2) Petitioner was never notified that he was entitled to a hearing under 49 C.F.R. Part 240.

Pursuant to 49 C.F.R. § 240.405(b), (c), a copy of the petition was sent to BNSF. The railroad elected to comment and was required by 49 C.F.R. § 240.405(d)(2) to provide Petitioner with a copy of the materials submitted to FRA.

## **BNSF's Response**

BNSF responded to Petitioner's assertions by arguing that:

- (1) Petitioner was qualified to operate over the territory involved, and was aware of the signal at this particular crossing.
- (2) The waiver signed by Petitioner clearly states that doing so waives the right to a formal hearing under Federal regulations.

### Locomotive Engineer Review Board's Determination

Based on its review of the record, the Board has determined that:

- (1) On May 8, 2011, at approximately 11:00 p.m., Petitioner operated BNSF train HOUALTI-08 in Galveston, TX.
- (2) At the same time, a BNSF manager was conducting operational tests by setting the signal at MP 135.8 to not display an aspect (dark signal). As a result, the prior signal at MP 132.9, Landes, displayed an approach indication, requiring Petitioner to approach the next signal prepared to stop. Petition at 1; BNSF at 3.
- (3) Petitioner allegedly did not operate his train in accordance with the signal at MP 135.8.
- (4) By undated letter signed by Petitioner on May 9, 2011, Petitioner was notified that his certification was suspended pending a hearing investigating the incident. This letter also stated that Petitioner was entitled to a formal hearing in compliance with 49 C.F.R. § 240.307 and that Petitioner could waive his right to the hearing. BNSF Exhibit A.
- (5) On May 8, 2011, Petitioner signed a waiver of his right to a formal hearing prior to the revocation of his certification. This waiver clearly specified that the hearing waived was under "49 CFR Part 240.307," and that in doing so, Petitioner had "knowledge and understanding of all [his] rights under 49 CFR Part 240 and voluntarily surrender them." BNSF Exhibit B.

#### Analysis of the Petition

In order for a waiver of a revocation of certification to be valid, the waiver must: (1) be made in writing; (2) reflect the fact that the person has knowledge and understanding of these rights and

voluntarily surrenders them; and (3) be signed by the person making the waiver. 49 C.F.R. § 240.307(f).

Although Petitioner presents arguments relating to the underlying violation, the Board cannot hear these arguments if it finds that the waiver document is valid. Petitioner asserts that he would not have waived his right to a hearing had he understood that "the hearing was coupled with a LERB hearing." However, the Notice of Certificate Revocation, signed by Petitioner on May 8, 2011, demonstrates that Petitioner was properly informed of his rights under 49 C.F.R. Part 240 and that he in fact waived his right to an on-the-property hearing for the purposes of certificate revocation.

The document states: "Sign at the end of this paragraph if you accept certificate revocation and waive your right to a formal hearing under 49 CFR Part 240.307. By doing so, you indicate that you have knowledge and understanding of all your rights under 49 CFR Part 240 and voluntarily surrender them." BNSF Exhibit B. This paragraph is immediately followed by Petitioner's signature. The document also indicates that Petitioner's certification was to be revoked from May 8, 2011 to June 7, 2011, further providing information that the document related to 49 C.F.R. Part 240 and not only to railroad discipline. Accordingly, the Board finds that the language contained in the waiver signed by Petitioner was sufficient to the extent that Petitioner should have reasonably been expected to have knowledge and understanding of his rights and voluntarily surrendered them on the date that he signed the waiver document. If a person does not understand a citation to 49 CFR Part 240.307 or 49 C.F.R. Part 240, or any other aspect of a waiver, the person should not sign the waiver. Petitioner's allegation that he didn't understand what he was signing cannot override the clear language in the written waiver that he voluntarily admits to signing. Petitioner does not deny that he signed the waiver, nor does Petitioner allege that the waiver was signed under duress. Petition at 2. Thus, the Board finds that the waiver met the requirements set forth in 49 CFR § 240.307(f).

By waiving his right to a certification hearing, Petitioner has precluded the creation of a record of a formal investigation. Without such a record, a proper analysis of the facts cannot be accomplished. The petition must therefore be denied in accordance with the provisions of 49 C.F.R. Part 240.

Issued in Chicago, IL on \_\_\_\_\_\_

H. ildi

Richard M. McCord Chairman, Locomotive Engineer Review Board

A copy of the Locomotive Engineer Review Board decision in this matter has been sent by certified mail and return receipt requested to each person shown below.

### SERVICE LIST EQAL 2011-36

## SENT CERTIFIED MAIL RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

Mr. K. J. Cross 19251 Sandelford Dr. Katy, TX 77449

Mr. Jack Sweeny Local Chairman Division 776 Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers and Trainmen P.O. Box 1169 Brazoria, TX 17422-1169

Ms. Kathy R. Conkling Manager, Certificate Administration Burlington Northern Santa Fe Railway Company 12345 College Park Boulevard Overland Park, KS 66210-1299

Diane Filipowicz Administrative Assistant

MAR 0 8 2012

Date

enc: Post LERB Memo

cc: FRA DOCKET EQAL 2011-36

	SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION	COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL	IVERY
	Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete	A. Signature	
	item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse	X	Agent
	<ul> <li>so that we can return the card to you.</li> <li>Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits.</li> </ul>	B. Received by (Printed Name)	C. Date of Delivery
	1. Article Addressed to:	D. Is delivery address different from ite If YES, enter delivery address belo	_
	Mr. K. J. Cross 19251 Sandelford Dr. Katy, TX_77449	3. Service Type	
		Certified Mail Express Ma	ll elpt for Merchandise
	EQAL 2011-34	4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee)	C Yes
	2. Article Number (Transfer from service label) 7008 3230	0002 3925 9409	
	PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic Re	sturn Receipt	102595-02-M-1540
	SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION	COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL	LIVERY
	Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete	A. Signature	
	Item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse	X	Agent Addressee
	<ul> <li>Attach this card to the back of the maliplece, or on the front if space permits.</li> </ul>	B. Received by (Printed Name)	C. Date of Delivery
	1. Article Addressed to:	D. Is delivery address different from its	
	Mr. Jack Sweeny Local Chairman Division 776 Brotharband of Locomotive Engineers an		W. 1110
	•	d Trainmen 3. Service Type Scertified Mait	
	Local Chairman Division 776 Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers an P.O. Box 1169	d Trainmen 3. Service Type Scertified Mait  Express M Registered	eji
	Local Chairman Division 776 Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers an P.O. Box 1169 Brazoria, TX 17422-1169	d Trainmen 3. Service Type GL Certified Mait Express M Registered St Return Rec Insured Mail C.O.D. 4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee)	ali celpt for Merchandise
	Local Chairman Division 776 Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers an P.O. Box 1169 Brazoria, TX 17422-1169 EQAL 2011-36 2. Article Number (Transfer from service label) 7008 323	d Trainmen 3. Service Type GL Certified Mait Express M Registered St Return Rec Insured Mail C.O.D. 4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee)	ali celpt for Merchandise
	Local Chairman Division 776 Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers an P.O. Box 1169 Brazoria, TX 17422-1169 EQAL 2011-36 2. Article Number (Transfer from service label) 7008 323	d Trainmen 3. Service Type SL Certified Mail Express M Registered SL Return Rec Insured Mail C.O.D. 4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee) 0 0002 3925 9416	ali selpt for Merchandise Ves 102595-02-M-1544
	Local Chairman Division 776 Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers an P.O. Box 1169 Brazoria, TX 17422-1169 EQAL 2011-36 2. Article Number (Transfer from service label) PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic R SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete	d Trainmen 3. Service Type G. Certified Mait Express M. Registered S. Return Rec Insured Mail C.O.D. 4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee) 0 0002 3925 9416 eturn Receipt	all Selpt for Merchandise Ves 102595-02-M-1544
	Local Chairman Division 776 Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers an P.O. Box 1169 Brazoria, TX 17422-1169 2. Article Number (Transfer from service label) PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic R SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired.	d Trainmen 3. Service Type Certified Mail Express M. Registered S. Return Rec Insured Mail C.O.D. 4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee) 0 0002 3925 9416 eturn Receipt COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL	ali selpt for Merchandise Ves 102595-02-M-1544
	Local Chairman Division 776 Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers an P.O. Box 1169 Brazoria, TX 17422-1169 EQUAL 2011-36 2. Article Number (Transfer from service label) PS Form 3811, February 2004 PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic R SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery Is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you. Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece,	d Trainmen 3. Service Type S-Certified Mait Express M Registered S-Return Rec Insured Mail C.O.D. 4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee) 0 0002 3925 9416 eturn Receipt COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL A. Signature	ali Selpt for Merchandise Ves 102595-02-M-154
	Local Chairman Division 776 Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers an P.O. Box 1169 Brazoria, TX 17422-1169 EQUAL 2011-36 2. Article Number (Transfer from service label) PS Form 3811, February 2004 PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic R SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 If Restricted Delivery Is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you.	d Trainmen 3. Service Type Certified Mail Express M. Registered S. Return Rec Insured Mail C.O.D. 4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee) 00002 3925 9416 eturn Receipt COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL A. Signature X B. Received by (Printed Name) D. Is delivery address different from iter	ali Selpt for Merchandise Ves 102595-02-M-154 VERY Agent Addressee C. Date of Delivery m 1?  Ves
	Local Chairman Division 776 Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers an P.O. Box 1169 Brazoria, TX 17422-1169 EQAL 2011-36 2. Article Number (Transfer from service label) PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic R SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you. Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits.	d Trainmen 3. Service Type S-Certified Mait Express M. Registered S-Return Rec Insured Mail C.O.D. 4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee) 0 0002 3925 9416 eturn Receipt COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DEL A. Signature X B. Received by (Printed Name)	ali Selpt for Merchandise Ves 102595-02-M-154 VERY Agent Addressee C. Date of Delivery m 1?  Ves
	Local Chairman Division 776 Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers an P.O. Box 1169 Brazoria, TX 17422-1169 EQAL 2011-36 2. Article Number (Transfer from service label) PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic R SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you. Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits. Article Addressed to: Ms. Kathy R. Conkling Manager, Certificate Administration	d Trainmen          3. Service Type         Certified Mail         Registered         Registered         Insured Mail         C.O.D.         4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee)         0         0         1         Received Delivery? (Extra Fee)         0         0         0         1         2         3         2         1         2         3         2         3         2         3         2         3         2         3         3         3         3         3         4         8         8         9         9         9         9         10         11         12         13         14         14         15         16         17         17         18         17	ali Selpt for Merchandise Ves 102595-02-M-154 VERY Agent Addressee C. Date of Delivery m 1?  Ves
	Local Chairman Division 776 Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers an P.O. Box 1169 Brazoria, TX 17422-1169 EQAL 2011-36 2. Article Number (Transfer from service label) PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic R SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you. Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits. Article Addressed to: Ms. Kathy R. Conkling Manager, Certificate Administration Burlington Northern Santa Fe Railway	d Trainmen           3. Service Type         Scertified Mail         Registered         Registered         Insured Mail         Insured Mail         C.O.D.         4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee)         0         0         1         Received Delivery? (Extra Fee)         0         0         0         1         Received Delivery? (Extra Fee)         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         10         11         12         13         14         15         16         17         18         17         18         18         17         18         19 <t< td=""><td>ali selpt for Merchandise Ves 102595-02-M-154 VERY Agent Addressee C. Date of Delivery m 1?  Ves</td></t<>	ali selpt for Merchandise Ves 102595-02-M-154 VERY Agent Addressee C. Date of Delivery m 1?  Ves
	Local Chairman Division 776 Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers an P.O. Box 1169 Brazoria, TX 17422-1169 EOAL 2011-36 2. Article Number (Transfer from service label) PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic R SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you. Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits. Article Addressed to: Ms. Kathy R. Conkling Manager, Certificate Administration	d Trainmen           3. Service Type         Scertified Mail         Registered         Registered         Insured Mail         C.O.D.         4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee)         0         0         10         2         3         4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee)         0         0         10         2         3         Service Type         X         10         11         12         13         14         15         16         17         17         18         17         18         17         18         10         19         10         10         11         12         13         14         14         15         16         17         18         18         19         10         10	ali Selpt for Merchandise Ves 102595-02-M-154 IVERY Agent Addressee C. Date of Delivery m 1? Yes w: No
	Local Chairman Division 776 Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers an P.O. Box 1169 Brazoria, TX 17422-1169	d Trainmen           3. Service Type         Scertified Mail         Registered         Registered         Insured Mail         C.O.D.         4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee)         0         0         10         2         3         2         3         4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee)         0         0         10         2         3         9         10         11         12         13         14         15         16         17         17         17         17         17         18         18         17         18         18         19         10         15         16         17         18         18         18         19         10         10         10         10         10 <td>ali Selpt for Merchandise Ves 102595-02-M-1540 IVERY Agent Agent Addressee C. Date of Delivery m 1? Yes w: No</td>	ali Selpt for Merchandise Ves 102595-02-M-1540 IVERY Agent Agent Addressee C. Date of Delivery m 1? Yes w: No
	Local Chairman Division 776 Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers an P.O. Box 1169 Brazoria, TX 17422-1169 EQAL 2011-36 2. Article Number (Transfer from service label) PS Form 3811, February 2004 Domestic R SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you. Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits. Article Addressed to: Ms. Kathy R. Conkling Manager, Certificate Administration Burlington Northern Santa Fe Railway 12345 College Park Boulevard Overland Park, KS 66210-1299	d Trainmen           3. Service Type         Scertified Mail         Registered         Registered         Insured Mail         C.O.D.         4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee)         0         0         0         0         1         Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee)         0         0         1         Received Delivery? (Extra Fee)         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         1         0         1         0         1         0         1         1         1         1         1         1         1         1         1         1         1         1         1         1         1         2         2         3         3         2         3         3	ali selpt for Merchandise Pes 102595-02-M-1544 IVERY Agent Agent Addressee C. Date of Delivery m 1? Yes w: No No